### The Translator's Religious Culture and its Impact on Translating into Arabic:

## William Shakespeare's *Othello Translation* as an Example

Dr. Basheer Eisawy,

Lecturer in English Literature,
Department of Foreign Languages,
College of Education, Mansourah University

### **Abstract**

This paper attempts to study two translations of Shakespeare's *Othello* by two distinguished Arab translators: Gabra Ibrahim Gabra and Professor Muhammad Enani. The study is going to investigate the religious culture, of each translator, and its impact on his translation. The major question addressed in the paper is: How far did religion interfere with their translations? Sixty five passages from the two translations were chosen with their original text for study and criticism. Six tables were used to deal with the topics of the study- language of oaths, secular versus religious diction, intertextuality, religious culture awareness and identicalness in both the translations.

### Introduction

In Othello<sup>1</sup>, William Shakespeare (1564-1616) introduces the dark Eastern Moroccan Othello as a stranger who is hated by his friends and soldiers. He is hated among white Westerners as a foreigner because of his color, race, and previous religion; lago sees him as a person who has no right to be given a position higher than the position of a Venetian national. The otherness of Othello -represented in his color, race, and past religion (Islam)- is a segregation line that discriminates against him in matters of work, love, and marriage. Othello deals with a major issue in Europe at the time it was written- the intermingling of Muslim religion and culture with the West. Although Othello century after the Muslims were was written а conquered in Spain, there had been obvious aspects of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> It was written in 1602-1603 and published in 1622.

hostility within the play to Othello's Moroccan origins because of difference in religion and culture. The hostility between the West and the East is also shown in the conflict between Venice and the Turks; the Christian Venetians want to protect Christendom from the influence of the Muslim Turks, and ironically, Moorish Othello is the soldier who is sent to accomplish this mission. Even though, he is regarded as a person who has no right to be promoted, no right to get married to Desdemona, but is obliged to protect Venice and its citizens against attacks from the Muslim Turks.

The tripartite discrimination against Othello may be conceived in the English text of Shakespeare's work. When *Othello* is translated into Arabic, a lot of problems arise. In the English text, the Venetian community is equipped to hate foreigners who may threaten their rights to key positions. But, pragmatically speaking, they do welcome the services rendered by these foreigners. In other words, foreigners, in Venice, have to confine themselves to certain limits of ambitions in work, love, and marriage.

Othello is a multicultural play that is supposed to bridge the gap between Venetians – representatives of the Western society- and the non-Westerners as represented by Othello. Cultural values are formed by environmental adaptations, historical factors, social and economic evolution, and contact with other cultural groups. Personal values are moulded by family and childhood experiences, folklore of the culture, social pressures including reward and punishment, religious education, formal schooling. Multiculturalism of Othello consists in the fact that it introduces a diversity of

values. They are the oriental values of Othello contrasted with the western values represented by lago and the other Venetians. A translation of a work of this sort has to help its readers in identifying the cultural symbols such as rituals, religious icons, traditional ceremonies and familial relationships in the Venetian culture.

Unfortunately, the translator's job does not include the process of interpreting the author's ideas on the basis of analysis of character development, point of view, and features of plot, such as climax and resolution. Readers expect a good translation to relate literature to their own lives and to help them discover their identity with the characters. They, also, expect the translation to appreciate the elements of human nature and the human condition common to all human kind.

In the case of Othello, in its English origin as well as in its Arabic translations, these two expectations are not verified. On the contrary, we are introduced to a world that is segregated and separated by isles of salt. multicultural text, the reader identifies with characters though they may be culturally different from him. These are not, at all, grasped in reading the struggles of Othello neither as a person from a different culture nor as a dominated or oppressed person. While a multicultural text is supposed to inspire its readers to seek out further learning and contact with people from other cultures, we find that Othello is introduced as a brutal criminal who kills the woman he adores over mere personal doubt. Instead of bridging the gap between the East and the West, we are challenged with the fact that these are two parallel shapes of mind and there is never a way to get them together. The cultural diversity is not introduced as a feature of a different culture; it is introduced as the core and the essence of the other's culture: the other, Othello, is physically and mentally alienated from Venice and the Venetians.

#### Statement of the Problem

On dealing with the two translations, of *Othello*, into Arabic rendered by Gabra Ibrahim Gabra (1920-1994) and Muhammad Enani (1939-), it may be observed that the religious culture of each one of them has affected their individual translations. Gabra introduced an Arabic text that entertains a lot of Christian traits and elements that are mainly related and included in the Shakespearean text. Enani produced a translation that has a lot of Islamic linguistic traits which may be attributed to intertextuality with the Quranic verses. The study will be concerned with showing examples of the religious influence on their translations of *Othello*.

### **Criticism and Analysis of the Two Translations**

This paper proposes that the two different translations of *Othello* are affected mainly by the religious background, culture, and rhetoric of each translator. Gabra, as an Arab Christian, seems to be quite keen to keep the Christian religious diction as it is, while Enani, as an Arab Muslim, seemingly attempts - now and then- not only to arabize his *Othello*, but also to Islamize it. On many occasions, Gabra gave the Arabic text its Christian spirit and milieu by using the Shakespearean words, terms, and phrases as they are. He may be obliged to do so out of being honest and dedicated to the original text regardless of its reception

- by the Arab reading public whose majority is Muslim. On the contrary, Enani seems to be more capable of incorporating his reading public in the reception of his text. His Islamic background and his ability to write poetry rendered his text to be more Muslim than Gabra's. A lot of intertextuality, twenty examples as shown in Table 3, is found.

Sixty five passages are chosen from *Othello* with their two Arabic translations of Gabra and Enani for analysis and criticism. The study will investigate the following issues: oaths in *Othello* and their two translations into Arabic (Table 1- 13 examples are given), Muslim diction versus Christian diction in *Othello* (Table 2 – 32 examples), intertextuality (Table 3- 23 examples-requoted from Table 2), religious terms kept as they are in both translations (Table 4- 7 examples), Christian versus Muslim awareness (Table 5-3 examples) and identicalness in both translations (Table 6-10 examples).

### A. Oaths in *Othello* and their two translations into Arabic

Through history, kings, presidents, premiers and ministers have been taking oaths as they are sworn in. Eye-witnesses, at law-courts, are asked to swear their hearts and souls to say the truth and nothing but the truth. Army and police officers, doctors, judges and lawyers begin their life career by reading out an oath in presence of their leaders. Men and women swear, in different ways, on their Holy Books or any other valuable things to give support and credibility to what they say or assume to be true. "At the time of Jesus in the 1st century, oaths were often misused and, for that

reason, were often rebuked in early Christianity. In Islam, a Muslim may make a *qasam* 'oath', in which he swears, for example, upon his life, soul, honour, or faith. Because the *qasam* is primarily a pledge to God, a false oath is considered a danger to one's soul" (Britannica).

In Othello, we come across a number of soldiers and they are well known for swearing their honor, their pride, to God and even to the life of their great leaders. Table 1 shows thirteen instances in which oaths are taken in Othello. The two translations are included in two separate columns under each translator's name: Gabra and Enani. Thirteen structures of oaths are used for criticism and analysis. Although Gabra gave six translations which entertained Christian elements: ' 'Sblood جروح المسيح Zounds' ' ,'ودم المسيح two times, 'By the mass إولتشهد السماء على الطوية إلى 'Heaven is my judge', 'المقداس', 'By heaven لا وحق مسيحيتي', he was well aware of the Muslim environment of the recipients. Therefore, he used six additional typical forms of Muslim oaths: , ( 'بالتأكيد ' Enani translated it as) لأننى والله Certes' Forsooth' اي والله 'By heaven) الماشاء الله (Enani translated it as 'لا والله and ' 'O, fie upon 'لا والله , and ' 'O, fie upon thee, slanderer بل والله صحيح ما أقول which Enani والله ان 'If thou dost', 'إن لم يكُ هذا حقاً فأنا كافرْ!' the original is not an oath, therefore Enani افعلت translated it as 'إن فعلت'). This indicates that Gabra has tried to accommodate his first six oaths with the Christian culture of the original Shakespearean text by finding Christian equivalents to them in Arabic. In the other six examples, he introduced common Muslim forms, which agree with the culture of the majority of his One example readers. was translated, almost identically, by Gabra and Enani: 'Lechery, by this hand ليد (Gabra) while Enani translated it as 'بل كانت فُجوراً.. وحق يميني هذه'

On the other hand, Enani gave five Muslim equivalents to his oaths, ignored one which Gabra took for an oath 'If thou dost ' and agreed with Gabra in one form. Enani gave Muslim equivalents for the following oaths: 'Sblood قسماً بحق رجولتي, Heaven is my judge قسماً بالله ¿Zounds أقسم 'Zounds ولأشهد الله قسماً بالله ويحق الإيمان بديني By heaven (ذي وجهين ويُدعي (جانوس)! Enani introduced one oath which is accepted in both Christian and Muslim contexts: 'By the mass 'قسماً بصلاتي. One more was completely ignored: 'Forsooth'.

We may conclude that the religious culture of Gabra and Enani has interfered with their translations of the oaths. Each one of them shaped them in the way that may seem adoptable and welcomed by their readers. But the study tends to conclude that Enani was in many instances more accurate than Gabra. The reception of a translation by the audience, or "readership" as Mona Baker puts it in her argument on ideology and translation (108-9), is likely to be responsible for its success. But, it is quite difficult to measure reception unless there are reliable statistics made by professional centers for measuring polls.

TABLE 1: Translation of Oaths by Gabra and Enani (13 Examples)

| Original Oath     | Gabra's                   | Enani's                  |
|-------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------|
|                   | Translation               | Translation              |
| IAGO 'Sblood,     | ياغو: ولكنك، ودم          | أقسم انك لاتسمعنى أبدأ!  |
| but you will not  | المسيح، ترفض الاصغاء الئ! | ,                        |
| hear me:(I, i,    | الاصغاء الئ!              |                          |
| 1.5)              |                           |                          |
| IAGO In           | یاغو: یجعلنی ملازمه،      | قسماً بحق رجولتي اني     |
| personal suit     | وأنا، وحق الايمان،        | لأعرف قيمتى وجدارتي      |
| to make me his    |                           | بالمنصب                  |
| lieutenant,       |                           |                          |
| Off-capp'd to     |                           |                          |
| him: and, by      |                           |                          |
| the faith of      |                           |                          |
| man, (I, i, I.10) |                           |                          |
| IAGO And, in      | ياغو: وفي النهاية         | وفى نهاية المطاف         |
| conclusion,       | يرد على وسطائى            | خاب سعى من توسطوا        |
| Nonsuits my       | التماسهم، قائلاً "لأننى   | من أجلى                  |
| mediators; for,   | والله                     | اذ قال" بالتأكيد! لكننى  |
| 'Certes,' says    | سبق أن اخترت الضابط       | انتهيت من تعيين الضابط   |
| he,               | الذى أريده".              | المختار"!                |
| (I, i, II.15-16)  |                           |                          |
| IAGO And what     |                           | ومن تراه كان؟ رجل        |
| was he?           | ياغو: ومن هو هذا؟         | ضليع في الحساب ومن       |
| Forsooth, a       | اى والله، رجل حسابات      | فلورنسا                  |
| great             | هائل                      |                          |
| arithmetician,    |                           |                          |
| (I, i, II.18-19)  |                           |                          |
| RODERIGO          | رودریجو:وهکذا             | أما أنا- رحماك ياربى بنا |
| By heaven, I      | (ماشاء الله!) يصبح        | - فسوف أحمل اللواء له    |
| rather would      | هو ملازمه،                |                          |

| Oninin al Oath      | Oalarala                 | En anilla                |
|---------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| Original Oath       | _Gabra's                 | Enani's                  |
| Wording             | Translation              | Translation              |
| have been his       |                          |                          |
| hangman.            |                          |                          |
| (I, i, I. 30)       |                          |                          |
| IAGO: Heaven        | ياغو: ولتشهد السماء      | ولأشهد الله أن لاحبً     |
| is my judge,        | على، أنا لااتبعه حباً    | في قلبي ولا أداء واجب    |
| not I for love      | وواجباً،                 |                          |
| and duty,           |                          |                          |
| (I, i, I. 60)       |                          |                          |
| IAGO: 'Zounds,      | ياغو: و جروح             | قسماً بالله سرقت!        |
| sir, you're         | المسيح، سيدى، لقد        | باللعار! البس معطفك و    |
| robb'd; for         | نهبوك! عيب! البس         | قُم!                     |
| shame, put on       | ثوبك!                    |                          |
| your gown;          |                          |                          |
| (I, i, I. 88)       |                          |                          |
| IAGO: 'Zounds,      | ياغو: وجروح المسيح       | أقسم انك يامولاي من      |
| sir, you are one    | ياسيدى، انك من قوم       | الذين ينتهون عن عبادة    |
| of those that       | يرفضون خدمة الله اذا     | الله، لو نهاهم الشيطان   |
| will not            | أمرهم الشيطان بذلك       | عنها                     |
| serve God, if       |                          |                          |
| the devil bid       |                          |                          |
| you. (I, i, I.      |                          |                          |
| 110)                |                          |                          |
| IAGO: By            | ياغو: لا والله، لا       | كلا! قسماً باله [ذي      |
| Janus, I think      | أحسب أنهم هم.            | وجهين] ويُدعى            |
| no. (I, ii, II. 34) |                          | (جانوس!                  |
| IAGO If thou        | ياغو: والله إن فعلت ،    | ياجو: إن فعلت فلن أحبك   |
| dost, I shall       | فنن أحبك أبداً بعدها! لا | بعدها أبداً إولماذا أيها |
| never love thee     | تكن سخيفاً!              | السيد الأبله؟            |
| after. Why,         |                          |                          |
| thou silly          |                          |                          |

| Original Oath      | Gabra's             | Enani's                 |
|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------------|
| Wording            | Translation         | Translation             |
| gentleman!         |                     |                         |
| (I, iii, I. 308)   |                     |                         |
| O, fie upon        | ياغو: بل والله صحيح | إن لم يكُ هذا حقاً فأنا |
| thee,              | ما أقول.            | كافرْ!                  |
| slanderer! (II, i, |                     |                         |
| I. 115)            |                     |                         |
| Lechery, by        |                     |                         |
| this hand;         | ياغو: بل فجور وحق   | بل كانت فُجوراً وحق     |
| (II, i, I. 260)    | هذه اليد!           | یمینی هذه!              |
| By the mass,       | ياغو: والقداس، طلع  | قسماً بصلاتي قد طلع     |
| 'tis               | الصبح!              | الصبح!                  |
| morning(II,        |                     |                         |
| iii, II. 350)      |                     |                         |
| By heaven, (IV,    | دزديمونه: لا وحق    | : كلا وبحق الإيمان      |
| ii, l. 82)         | مسيحيتي!            | بدینی!                  |

### **B. Secular Diction Versus Religious Diction**

Table 2 includes thirty-two instances from the two translations of *Othello* by Gabra and Enani. This section of the study attempts to investigate the cultural approach according to which every individual translator dealt with the original quotations: Did they give secular or religious equivalents on translating into Arabic?

It may be observed that Gabra, in almost all of the twenty three re-quotations in Table 3, has introduced either pure secular or Christian translations while Enani gave religious translations for the same words or structures. These translations may render Enani's text as if it were written originally by a Muslim writer. The term secular may be defined as "of or relating to the

worldly or temporal / not overtly or specifically religious / not ecclesiastical or clerical" (Merriam-Webster Dictionary). As for the word religious, it can be defined as "relating to or manifesting faithful devotion to an acknowledged ultimate reality or deity / of, relating to, or devoted to religious beliefs or observances" (*Ibid.*).

TABLE 2: Secular versus Religious (32 Examples)

| Original Wording  | Gabra's  | Enani's Translation   |
|---|--|---|
| 21.3  |  |   |
| OTHELLO: Most humbly therefore bending to your state, I crave fit disposition for my wife. (I, iii, II. 236-237)                                | Translation عطیل: ولذلك فاننی بكل تواضع وانصیاع لسلطتكم أرجو منكم ترتیباً ملائماً لزوجتی،    | و الآن أرجوكم بكل تواضع<br>وتجلة لمقامكم<br>اعداد ما تحتاجه حليلتى وما<br>يناسبها           |
| DESDEMONA:<br>The rites for<br>which I love him<br>are bereft me, (I,<br>iii, II. 257)  | ديزدمونه: فاننى أحرم<br>الحقوق التى من أجلها<br>أحبه.  | فلسوف أكون سلبت شعائر حبى أو ما أحببت الرجل بسببه.  |
| IAGO Let us be conjunctive in our revenge against him: if thou canst cuckold him, thou dost thyself a pleasure, me a sport. (I, iii, II. 367-9) | ياغو: فلنتآزر معاً في انتقامنا منه.فإذا استطعت ان تركب له قروناً. أوجدت متعةلنفسك و لهواً لي | فلنتحالف في الثأر منه،<br>فإذ استطعتُ تدنيس عرضه،<br>نلت أنت لذتك،و حققتُ أنا<br>مرام لهوِي |
| I hate the Moor:<br>And it is thought<br>abroad, that 'twixt<br>my sheets   | ياغو: اني اكره المغربي.<br>لقد دار بين الناس أنه بين<br>شراشفي<br>أدى مهمتي.                 | أكره ذاك الرجل ابن المغرب!<br>فالظن الشائع أن الرجل قضى<br>في فرشى وطره!                    |

| Original Mardin          | Cabrala                                 | Enonilo Translation                       |
|--------------------------|---|---|
| Original Wording         | Gabra's                                 | Enani's Translation                       |
| Halaa daa                | Translation                             |   |
| He has done my           |   |   |
| office                   |   |   |
| (I, iii, II. 383-5)      | * • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • |   |
| lago is most             | عطيل: ياغو أمين جداً.                   | (ياجو) أصدق خلق الله و                    |
| honest.                  |   | أولاهم بالثقة لديّ.                       |
| (II, iii, II. 188-189)   | *                                       |   |
| My boat sails            | ياجو: ابحر زورقي حراً.                  | سارت المركب في اليم؛                      |
| freely,                  |   |   |
| (II, iii, I. 55)         | • • •                                   |   |
| Well, God's              | كاسيو: فالله فوق الجميع،                | الله                                      |
| above all; and           | وهناك أنفس يجب انقاذها ،                | فوق الجميع والناس                         |
| there be souls           | و أنفس يجب ألا تنقذ.                    | فريقان الذين هم ناجون،و                   |
| must be saved,           |   | الذين هم                                  |
| and there be             |   | في الجحيم!                                |
| souls must not be        |   |   |
| saved. (II, iii, II. 89- |   |   |
| 90)                      | 40 .                                    |   |
| virtuous                 |   | من صاحبة العصمة                           |
| Desdemona                | الفاضلة                                 |   |
| (I1I, i, I. 34)          | ₹ <b>.</b>                              |   |
| Give me                  | كاسيو: أن تيسري لي حديثاً               | and the second                            |
| advantage of             | موجزأ                                   | بأن تتيحي لى أن أختلى                     |
| some brief               | مع دزديمونة على انفراد.                 | (بدزدمونه)                                |
| discourse                |   | حتى أبادلها حديثاً موجزاً!                |
| With Desdemona           |   |   |
| alone.                   |   |   |
| (I1I, i, II. 51-2)       | 8                                       | March   A   A   A   A   A   A   A   A   A |
| That he would            | _                                       | إذ كيف ينسل و يمضي مثل                    |
| steal away so            | كمجرم                                   | من أتى ذنباً                              |
| guilty-like, (I1I, iii,  |   |   |
| I. 40)                   | ***                                     |   |
| If I have any            | ديزدمونه: إن تكن لي دالة                | إذا كنتُ حقاً لديك عزيزةً! إذا            |
| grace or power to        | عليك أو قوة للتأثير فيك،                | كنت تقبل منى الشفاعة                      |
| move you,                | تقبل خضوعه الحالي                       | فهيا اصفح الآن عنه!                       |
| His present              | لمصالحته.                               |   |
| reconciliation           |   |   |

| Original Warding                  | Gabra's                                     | Enani's Translation  |
|-----------------------------------|---|--|
| Original Wording                  | Translation                                 | Enam S Translation   |
| 4-1- (41-11-11-40                 | Halisialion                                 |  |
| take; (I1I, iii, II. 46-<br>47)   |   |  |
| 47)                               |   |  |
| but in a man                      | عطيل: أما من الرجل                          | لكنه في منطق الأبرار   |
| that's just (I1I,                 | المستقيم                                    | ــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــ   |
| iii, l. 126)                      | (   |  |
| Keep leets and                    | ياجو: في جلسات                              | بل تعقد الجلسات فيه للتأمل   |
| law-days and in                   | كالمحكمة، وتتناقش                           | المشروع أو   |
| session sit                       | حول تأملات مشروعه؟                          | لتصدر الأحكام في شاأن  |
| With meditations                  |   | العباد!؟   |
| lawful? (I1I, iii, II.            |   |  |
| 140-41)                           |   |  |
| cuckold lives                     | ياغو: سعيداً يعيش الزوج                     | الديوث يعيش وينعم بحياته   |
| in bliss (I1I, iii, I.            | المخدوع                                     |  |
| 168)                              |   |  |
| In Venice they do                 |   | إن الألاعيب التي تحجبها  |
| let heaven see the                | يسمحن للسماء أن ترى                         | • • •  |
| pranks                            | الألاعيب                                    | قد لا يُحيط بالخداع فيها غير   |
| They dare not                     | التي لا يجسرن على أن                        | رب الكون!  |
| show their                        | يرينها أزواجهن                              |  |
| husbands;                         |   |  |
| (I1I, iii, II. 203-204)           |   | العامل المال ا |
| 'Tis destiny                      | , , ,                                       | قد خط القدر/ بأن أكون ديوثا  |
| unshunnable, like                 | القرون هذا                                  |  |
| death:                            |   |  |
| Even then this                    |   |  |
| forked plague is                  |   |  |
| fated to us                       |   |  |
| (I1I, iii, II. 275-276)           | عادات بالمغالة الأدماد                      | عطيل: انتبه يا وغد لي!   |
| Villain, be sure<br>thou prove my | عطیل: یا وغد! تأکد من البرهان علی أن حبیبتی |  |
| love a whore,                     | البرهان على ال حبيبي الغيّ!                 | ا بيد ان سبب عي ان حبيبي<br>أنا عاهرة!   |
| (111, iii, l. 360)                | جي:   | 1. <u>-</u> /  |
| See Cassio wipe                   | ياجو: كاسيو يمسح ذقنه                       | يمسح لحيته اليوم به  |
| his beard                         | پېو. دسيو پست تده.                          | يسي سيد ايرم ب   |
| with. (I1I, iii, I.               | • 7   |  |
| with. (111, III, I.               |   |  |

| Original Wording                  | Gabra's                      | Enani's Translation         |
|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Original wording                  | Translation                  | Elialii 5 Halisialion       |
| 440)                              | Translation                  |                             |
| 440)                              | • er . i . i                 | وسوف أكون مطيعاً بكل        |
| Let him                           | ياغو: ولسوف تكون             | - ' ' ' ' '                 |
| command,                          | الطاعة مني حنواً وشفقة       | التعاطف والإشفاق            |
| And to obey shall                 | مهما يكن الأمر مفعماً بالدم. | لأى أوامر منه ولو كان أمراً |
| be in me remorse,                 |                              | بسفك الدماء!                |
| What bloody                       |                              |                             |
| business                          |                              |                             |
| ever. (I1I, iii, II. 468-<br>470) |                              |                             |
| So they do                        | ياغو: ما دام لا يفعل         |                             |
| nothing, 'tis a                   | شيئاً، فانه زلل مغفور        | فهى هفوة طفيفة              |
| venial slip: (IV, i, l.           |                              |                             |
| 9)                                |                              |                             |
| A most unhappy                    | دزديمونة: خلاف بائس          | - ,                         |
| one: I would do                   | جداً. وبودي لو افعل الكثير   | البالغ! وليتنى استطعت أن    |
| much                              | كى اصالح بينهما ،            | أصلح ذات البين!             |
| To atone them,                    |                              |                             |
| (IV, i, II. 220-221)              |                              |                             |
| Your wife, my                     |                              | مولاى إننى زوجتكِ ! حليلية  |
| lord; your true                   | مولاى . زوجتك الصادقة        | وفية مخلصة!                 |
| And loyal wife.                   | الامينة                      |                             |
| (IV, ii, II. 34-35)               |                              | ,                           |
| and you might                     |                              | وما أسرع ما تستطيعين        |
| quickly make it                   | تصححيه.                      | التكفير عنه!                |
| right. (IV, iii, I. 81)           |                              |                             |
| Not to pick bad                   | ديزدمونه: فلا آخذ السوء      | حتى لا أقفو الشر بشر        |
| from bad, (IV, iii,               | بالسوء،                      |                             |
| I. 105 )                          |                              | 3 6 6                       |
| Quick, quick; fear                |                              | أسرع! لا تتباطأ أو تُوجِسٍ  |
| nothing; (V, i, I.                | تخف شيئاً.                   | خيفة!                       |
| 4)                                |                              |                             |
| Yet I'll not shed                 | عطیل: ولکننی لن أسفك         | لكن لن أريق الدم قط         |
| her blood; (V, ii,                | دمها ،                       |                             |
| l. 4)                             |                              |                             |
| Nay, if you                       | عطیل: أبدأ، حتى لو كافحت     | كلا لو جاهدت                |
| strive—                           |                              |                             |

| Original Wording        | Gabra's                 | Enani's Translation       |
|-------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------|
|                         | Translation             |                           |
| (V, ii, I. 81)          |                         |                           |
| She false with          | إميليا: خائنة مع كاسيو؟ | وقلتی إن (كاسيو) قد زنی   |
| Cassio!did you          |                         | بها ؟                     |
| say with Cassio?        |                         |                           |
| (V, ii, I. 183)         |                         |                           |
| Do you go back          | عطيل: أترتد فزعاً؟      | تراك قد نكصت في فزع؟      |
| dismay'd?               |                         |                           |
| (V, ii, I. 272)         |                         |                           |
| Fall'n in the           | لودوفيكو: لقد وقعت في   | ثم وقعت في حبائل الوغد    |
| practice of a           | مكيده هذا العبد اللعين  | الزنيم ماذا يا ترى        |
| damned slave,           |                         |                           |
| What shall be           |                         |                           |
| said to thee? (V, ii,   |                         |                           |
| II. 295-6)              |                         |                           |
| That there he           |                         | وقال أنه ألقي به في غرفتي |
| dropp'd it for a        | لمأرب في نفسه           | لحاجة في نفسه قضاها       |
| special purpose         | يحقق رغبة له.           |                           |
| Which wrought to        |                         |                           |
| his desire. (V, ii, II. |                         |                           |
| 326-7)                  |                         |                           |
| Your power and          | لودوفيكو: اننا نجردك من |                           |
| your command is         | السلطة والقيادة،        | ومنصب القيادة             |
| taken off,              |                         |                           |
| (V, ii, II. 336)        |                         |                           |

This comparison of the two translations may lead us to the argument on domestication and foreignization as two major translation strategies introduced by the American translation theorist L. Venuti in his book The *Translator Invisibility* (1995). "Generally speaking, domestication designates the type of translation in which a transparent, fluent style is adopted to minimize the strangeness of the foreign text for target language readers, while foreignization means a target text is produced which deliberately breaks target conventions

by retaining something of the foreignness of the original" (Yang ). In the light of these definitions of domestication and foreignization, we may find out that achieve Gabra's translation did not lot а domestication of the Shakespearean text into Arabic. His text, in many aspects, remains alien to the Arab readers though written in Arabic. It may be acceptable to say that Gabra has used foreignization effectively to translate cultural elements of the foreign text regardless of accepting them by the Arab readers. He was very honest to the culture of the source language (SL) text. In Enani's translation, domestication is more frequently employed. It is the dominating translation strategy which he adopts while translating Othello into Arabic. This may be seen as "assimilation of the source text to the target culture" (Baker: 108). Also, Enani could be seen as a follower of Kokhovskii, the Russian theorist "who claims a translation as his own work because the simple fact of putting words into another language has given it a 'new colouring'" (Ibid.).

Table 3 incorporates the Quranic verses that are responsible for the intertextuality with both Gabra's and Enani's translations which took place in two examples only. In Enani's translation, there are 20 cases of intertextuality with the Quranic verses.

On studying the equivalents given by Gabra, in Tables 2 and 3, it is found that out of 32 examples, only 2 translations by Gabra intertextualize with the Quranic verses: a whore بغي which intertextualizes with " يا أخت " which intertextualizes with " يا أخت " O sister of المارون ما كان أبوك امراً سوء وما كانت أمك بغيا" O sister of Harun 'Aaron'! Your father was not a man who used to commit adultery, nor your mother was unchaste

woman" (Alhilali and Khan: 405) and "Yet I'll not shed her blood" - "لَن أَسفك دمها" which recalls the verse "وَإِذْ أَخَذْنَا "And remember when We took your covenant: shed not the blood of your people" (*Ibid*.: 17). The other 30 examples may be read as secular or as much Christian as included in Shakespeare's text without any religious culture interference.

On the other hand, in Enani's translation, there are 20 (Table 3) structures that intertextualize with the Quranic verses. Gabra translated 'my wife' as 'نوجتى' while Enani translated it as 'حليلتى.' This intertextualizes with "حليلت " – "the wives of your sons" (Ibid.: 110). The same principle was implemented on translating 'your true /And loyal wife' – 'لله وفيةٌ مخلصةُ!' – while Gabra translated it as ' نروجتك الصادقة الامينة ' Their husbands' was translated as 'أزواجهن' (Gabra) while Enani translated it as 'حليلها' which is not a Quranic equivalent but agrees with the Muslim jurisdiction vocabulary.

In his argument on intertextuality, M. H. Abrams states that Julia Kristeva (1941-) has made this term popular. It is used to "signify the multiple ways in which any one literary text is inseparably inter-involved with other texts, whether by its open or covert citations and allusions, or its assimilation of the formal and substantive features of an earlier text or texts, or simply by its participation in the common stock of linguistic and literary conventions and procedures that are 'always ready' in place and constitute the discourses in which we are born' (285). According to this definition, Holy books are of those sources that take part in the shaping of our culture and 'constitute the discourses in which we are born'. There is no doubt that the Quranic verses

do intermingle with Arabic culture and traditions. Moreover, they are the source of Arabic as a language and the only canonization —linguistically speaking—to accept new words or refuse them. Many Arab speakers find themselves in a position to intermingle Quranic verses or even words, 'citations and allusions' that are related to the Quran or simply to assimilate them in new versions of language structures. In this paper, intertextuality is detected in many structures in the translations of both Gabra and Enani.

In fourteen examples, intertextuality with the Quranic verses in the translation of Enani resulted in promoting the language register from a common one to an uncommon, or rather from unpoetical to poetical.

- 'rites' is translated as 'الْحقوق' while Enani translated it as 'شعائر'. The Quranic verse that intertextualizes with this word is revealed to the Muslims practicing pilgrimage (hajj) and visiting the Holy Kaaba (omrah) while the original Shakespearean text is dealing with the rights of husbands and wives.
- Another promotion takes place when Desdemona talks to Othello begging him to forgive one of his men 'If I have grace and power to move you/His present reconciliation take'. It is translated as ' عليك أو قوة للتأثير فيك، تقبل خضوعه 'by Gabra. Enani gave a translation which was quite religious ' الحالي لمصالحته. Table 3 included two verses from the Quran that intertextualize with the meaning given by Enani: both are related to the will of God as

- related to reconciliation and forgiving His worshippers.
- In the same way, 'but in man that's just' is translated as 'الكنه في منطق الأبرار'. This translation intertextualizes with a verse in the Quran in which God promised Eden for kind-hearted worshippers while Gabra simply translated it as 'الرجل المستقيم'. That agrees with the status of a good statesman.
- Promotion is found in translating 'with meditation': 'الأحكام في شئون العباد' (Enani) that is related to God's rules and regulations as related to his worshippers. Gabra translated it as 'حول 'which is secular.
- 'To atone them' meaning to reconcile two persons with each other is translated as ' البين أصلح ذات' (Enani) is affected by the Quranic verse: "The believers are nothing else than brothers. So make reconciliation between your brothers, ..." (Ibid.: 699). The original situation concerns the reconciliation between any two common people who may not be 'believers' in God. This promotion was un-needed. Gabra was more realistic when he translated it as 'كى أصلح بينهما'.
- Had Shakespeare written 'fear nothing' in an epic, Enani's translation of this structure 'لا تتباطأ و 'would have been the best as it intertextualized with the Quranic verse "Moses conceived fear in himself" (Ibid.: 419) where God spoke with Moses describing the latter's fear on meeting the pharaoh and his followers. But, as long as it is in a tragedy of common human

- beings, Gabra's translation looks more pragmatic and secular: الاتخف شيئاً'.
- The 'damned slave' is a description of Othello given by Lodovico and translated as 'الوغد الزنيم' (Enani). It is a reminder of the Quranic description of Alwaleed Ibn Almugheerah —one of the opponents to the Prophet Muhammad: "عنل " ["cruel, and moreover base born (of illegitimate birth)] (Ibid.: 775). This is a promotion for an ordinary person who is nothing but a 'damned slave' and here Gabra's translation 'اللعين may be appropriate. Luckily enough, no allegations of racism will be brought against Enani because of his excellent translation, but Shakespeare and Gabra will not survive the accusation of racism and color bar in particular.
- Another example of register promotion is found in the translation of "your power and command is taken off": 'انا نجردك من السلطة والقيادة' (Gabra), which is quite secular and is rendered by Enani as ' لقد ' -in Enani's translation- "is taken off" is quite religious. It is affected by the Quranic verse: ["My wealth has not availed me. My power and (and arguments to defend myself) have gone from me"] (Ibid.: 781).
- 'twixt my sheets/He has done my office' is translated by Gabra as 'بين شراشفي أدى مهمتي', while Enani rendered it as 'قضي في فراشي وطره' which intertextualizes with the Quranic story of Zaid one of the servants of Prophet Muhammad who divorced his wife to marry her to the Prophet: "قضي زيد منها وطرأ
   "So when Zaid had

- accomplished his desire from her (*i.e.* divorced her), We gave her to you in marriage, ..."] (*Ibid.*: 566). The two situations are strikingly paradoxical: the Shakespearean scene is describing sheer adultery, the other is teaching morality in a certain context.
- The same promotion is indicated on translating "My boat sails freely": 'سارت فی الیم', which reminds of the story of Moses' mother when God ordered her to throw him into the river: ["Put him (the child) into the Tabut (box or case or a chest) and put it into the river (Nile); ..."] (Ibid.: 416-7). Contrary to this, Gabra's translation is quite secular: 'أبحر زورقی حراً'.
- There is another instance that intertextualizes with Moses in the Quran: 'his beard' is translated into 'لَقَنه' (Enani) while Gabra rendered it as 'لَقَنه' (Enani's word is very religious and Gabra's is not. Moreover, Enani's translation reminds the reader of the of Moses and his brother in the Quran: ["He Harun (Aaron) said: O son of my mother, Seize (me) not by my beard, nor by my head"] (Ibid.: 423).
- Enani's approach of promoting the language register succeeded much more than Gabra's in translating the following structure: 'There be souls must saved, and there be souls must not be saved'. While Gabra translated it as 'وهناك أنفس يجب ألاتنقذ (Enani translated it as اليجب انقاذها، وأنفس يجب ألاتنقذ Enani's translation recalls the Quranic verse: "الذين هم في الجحيم' وياقوم ما لي أدعوكم الي النجاة "And O my people! How is it that

- I call you to salvation while you call me to the Fire?" (*Ibid.* 636).
- Enani translated 'if you strive' as 'كلا لو جاهدت' which intertextualizes with the Quranic verse "وجاهدوا بأموالكم و أنفسكم" "and strive hard with your wealth and your lives" (*Ibid*.: 251) while Gabra rendered it as 'حتى لو كافحت'. Jihad is a typical debatable meaning that has brought a lot of violence and terror in the Muslim world recently.
- On translating 'bloody business', we have two translations: Enani's 'يسفك الدم' and Gabra's 'بالدم مفعماً '. This retrieves the Quranic verse " واذ أخذنا " ["And (remember) when we took your covenant (saying), shed not the blood of your (people), ..."] (*Ibid*.: 17). The Quranic scene is holy while the Shakespearean one is earthly. Therefore, Gabra's secular translation appears to be more appropriate.

Enani's great translation, which adopted promotion of Shakespeare's language register and the intertextuality with the Quran, has targeted the Arab reading public. Gabra translated the same structures as they were written by Shakespeare for his non-Arab audience.

**Table 3: Intertextuality (20 Examples)** 

|               | Gabra's                | Translation    | Enani             | 's Translation                  |
|---------------|------------------------|----------------|-------------------|---------------------------------|
| Original      | Wordin                 | Intertextualit | Wordin            | Intertextuality                 |
| Wording       | g                      | y Quranic      | g                 | Quranic verses                  |
|               |                        | verses         |                   |                                 |
| my wife       | زوجتى                  |                | حليلتي            | "و حلائل أبنائكم                |
|               |                        |                |                   | الذين من أصلابكُم"              |
|               |                        |                |                   | (النساء: 23 )                   |
| Rites         | الحقوق                 |                | شعائر             | "ذلك ومن يعظم                   |
|               |                        |                |                   | شعائر الله فإنها من             |
|               |                        |                |                   | تقوى ألقلوب"                    |
|               |                        |                |                   | (الحج : 32)                     |
| cuckold him   | تركب له                |                | تدنیس             | (02:67                          |
| Cuckola IIIII | عر <u>ب</u> ـ          |                | عرضه              |                                 |
|               | -32                    |                | <b></b>           |                                 |
|               |                        |                |                   |                                 |
|               |                        |                |                   |                                 |
| 'twixt my     | ****                   |                | قضی فی            | "فلما قضى زيد منها              |
| sheets        | بين                    |                |                   | قلما قصلی رید منها<br>وطرا"     |
|               | شراشفي<br>أ.           |                | فرش <i>ی</i><br>۱ | ~ ~                             |
| He has done   | أدى                    |                | وطره!             | (الأحزاب:37)                    |
| my office     | مهمت <i>ي.</i><br>ابحر |                |                   |                                 |
| My boat       | ابحر                   |                | سارت              | "فَاقَدِفِيهِ فِي الْيَمِّ"     |
| sails freely, | زور <u>ق</u> ي         |                | المركب            | (طه: 39)                        |
| •••           | حرأ.                   |                | في اليم؛          |                                 |
| there be      | وهناك                  |                | الذين هم          | "وَيَا قُوْمِ مَا لِي           |
| souls must    | أنفس يجب               |                | ناجون،و           | أَدْعُوكُمْ ۚ إَلَٰى النَّجَاةِ |
| be saved,     | انقاذها ، و            |                | الذين هم          | وَتَدْعُوننِي إلى ال            |
| and there be  | أنفس يجب               |                | في                | النَّارِ". (عَافر: 41)          |
| souls must    | ألا تنقذ               |                | الجحيم!           |                                 |
| not be        |                        |                | ,                 |                                 |
| saved.        |                        |                |                   |                                 |
| steal away    | أيخرج                  |                | إذ كيف            | "لِيَغْفِرَ لَكَ اللَّهُ مَا    |
| so guilty-    | متسسللاً               |                | ينسل و            | تَقَدَّمُ ۖ مِنْ ذَنْبِكَ"      |
| like          | كمجرم                  |                | یمضی مثل          | (الفتح:2)                       |
|               | , ••                   |                | ر من أبّى من أبّى | (                               |
|               |                        |                | نبأ               |                                 |
|               |                        |                | *-                |                                 |
|               |                        |                |                   |                                 |

|               | Gabra's            | Translation      | Enani      | 's Translation   |
|---------------|--------------------|------------------|------------|--|
| Original      | Wordin             | Intertextualit   | Wordin     | Intertextuality  |
| Wording       | g                  | y Quranic        | g          | Quranic verses   |
|               |                    | verses           |            |  |
| grace or      | دالة عليك          |                  | إذا كنت    | مَنْ ذَا الَّذِي يَشْفَعُ  |
| power to      | أو قوة             |                  | تقبل مني   | عِنْدَهُ إِلَّا بِإِذْنِهِ"  |
| move you,     | للتأثير            |                  | الشفاعة    | (البقره: ِ255)   |
| His present   | فيك،               |                  | فهيا اصفح  | "وَمَا أُصِنَابَكُم مِّن   |
| reconciliatio | تقبل               |                  | الآن عنه!  | مُّصِيبَةٍ فَبِمَا كُسَبَتْ  |
| n take;       | خضوعه              |                  |            | أَيْدِيكُمْ وَيَعْفُو عَن  |
|               | الحالي             |                  |            | كَثِير"(الشورى:30)   |
|               | لمصالحته.          |                  |            |  |
| but in a      | أما من             |                  | لكنه في    | " إن الأبرار لفي   |
| man that's    | الرجل              |                  | منطق       | نعيم" (الانفطار:82)  |
| just          | المستقيم           |                  | الأبرار    | , , , , ,  |
| With          | حول                |                  | الأحكام في |  |
| meditations   | تأملات             |                  | شأن        |  |
| lawful?       | مشروعه؟            |                  | العباد!؟   |  |
|               |                    |                  |            |  |
| their         | أزواجهن            |                  | حليلها     |  |
| husbands      |                    |                  |            |  |
| a whore       | بغيّ               | "يا أخت هارون ما | عاهرة      |  |
|               |                    | كان أبوك امرأ    |            |  |
|               |                    | سوء وما كانت     |            |  |
|               |                    | أمك بغيا" (مريم  |            |  |
|               | ه پيره             | (28:             | • •        | المُعْدِينَ مِنْ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعْدِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِي الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِي الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِي الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِينِ الْمُعِلِي الْمُعِلِ |
| his beard     | ذقنه               |                  | لحيته      | قَالَ يَا ابْنَ أُمَّ لَا تَأْخُذُ   |
| <del> </del>  |                    |                  |            | بِلِحْيَتِي" (طه: 94)  |
| bloody        | مفعماً             |                  | بسفك       | "ُوَإِذْ أُخَذْنَا مِيثَاقَكُمْ لاَ  |
| business      | بالدم.             |                  | الدماء!    | تَسْفُكُونَ دِمَاءَكُم"  |
|               |                    |                  |            | (البقره: 84)   |
| they do       | ٠,                 |                  | إن أحجما   | "وَمَنْ يَكْسِبْ خَطِيئَة  |
| nothing       | يفعل شيئاً         |                  | عن         | أَوْ إِثْمًا" (النساء:   |
|               |                    |                  | اقتراف     | (112   |
|               |                    |                  | الإثم      | س میں و در   |
| To atone      | کی اصالح<br>بینهما |                  | أصلح ذات   | "إِنَّمَا اللَّمُوْمِنُونَ   |
| them          | بينهما             |                  | البين!     | إِخْوَةٌ فَأَصْلِحُواْ بَيْنَ  |
|               |                    |                  |            | أَخَوَيْكُمْ وَٱتَّقُواْ ٱللَّهَ   |

|               |             | Translation                    |                  | 's Translation               |
|---------------|-------------|--------------------------------|------------------|------------------------------|
| Original      | Wordin      | Intertextualit                 | Wordin           | Intertextuality              |
| Wording       | g           | y Quranic                      | g                | Quranic verses               |
|               |             | verses                         |                  |                              |
|               |             |                                |                  | لَعَلَّكُمْ تُرْحَمُونَ"     |
|               |             |                                |                  | (الحجرات:10)                 |
| your true     | زوجتك       |                                | حليلة وفية       | "وَحَلائِلُ أَبْنَائِكُمْ    |
| And loyal     | الصادقة     |                                | مخلصةً           | الَّذِينَ مَنْ               |
| wife          | الامينة     |                                | -                | أصُّلابِكُمْ"(النساء:        |
| WIIC          |             |                                |                  | (23                          |
| Not to pick   | فلا آخذ     |                                | حتى لا           | "ولاتقف ما ليس لك            |
| bad from      | السوء       |                                | أقفو الشر        | به علم"                      |
| bad Irom      | بالسوع      |                                | ہــو ہــر<br>بشر | ب<br>(الاسراء:36)            |
| Dau           | بسوء        |                                | بسر              | (36.8)                       |
| fear nothing  | لا تخف      |                                | لا تتباطأ        | فأوجس في نفسه "              |
| loan nouning  | شيئاً       |                                | أوَ تُوجِس       | و. ق<br>خيفة موسى"           |
|               |             |                                | خيفةً!           | (طه:67)                      |
| Yet I'll not  | لن أسفك     | "وَإِذْ أَخَذْنَا              | أريق الدم        | (07. –)                      |
|               | _           | ورٍد الحدد<br>مِيتًاقَكُمْ لاَ | ریق اندم<br>قط   |                              |
| shed her      | دمها ،      |                                | <u>تط</u>        |                              |
| blood         |             | تَسْفِكُونَ دِمَاءَكُم"        |                  |                              |
|               |             | (البقره: 84)                   |                  |                              |
| if you strive | حتى لو      |                                | کلا لو           | "وَچَاهِدُوا بِأَمْوَالِكُمْ |
|               | كافحت       |                                | جاهدت            | وَأَنْفُسِكُمْ"              |
|               |             |                                |                  | (التوبه: 41)                 |
| damned        | العبد       |                                | الوغد            | "عُتُلِّ بعد ذلك زَنيم"      |
| slave         | اللعين      |                                | الزنيم           | " (القلم:13)                 |
| Your power    | اننا نجردك  |                                | لقد              | "مَا أغْنَىٰ عَنِّي          |
| and your      | من          |                                | نزعنا عنك        | مَالِيَهُ". هلك عتى          |
| command is    | س<br>السلطة |                                | سلطانك           | سلطانيا"                     |
| taken off     | والقيادة،   |                                | ومنصب            | (الحاقةُ:28-29)              |
|               | ,           |                                | القيادة          | (20 20)                      |
|               |             |                                | -                |                              |

### C. Religious Terms Are Kept as they Are in Both Translations

Table 4 includes seven examples of seven translations that maintained the religious culture of the original text of Shakespeare. Gabra translated them as they are except for one example: 'Are you fast married?'- 'هل تزوجت شرعاً؟' which shows the influence of Muslim culture on Gabra. Enani, as well, flavored it with a Muslim equivalent: 'أتراك عقدت قرانك فعلاً؟'.

The other six examples are a little changed in the translation of Enani: 'O Heaven' – 'ياللسماء' (Gabra), 'يالله الله (Enani); 'that heaven had made her such a man' – 'ياالله (Gabra), 'لو أن السماء جعلتها رجلاً مثلى لو أن رب الكون أبدع خلقها (Gabra), 'لو أن السماء جعلتها رجلاً مثلى هبوط الجحيم عن ' – 'Enani); 'As hell's from heaven' السماء (Enani); 'cabra) السماء تليق بمضجع رب ' (Gabra), 'تليق حتى بجوبتر' – 'sport for Jove' اللرباب لو أن مشيئة ' – 'Gabra) الأرباب لو أن مشيئة ' – 'Enani) and 'Had it pleased heaven' السماء (Gabra), 'السماء الو أن البارى', (Gabra) السماء

## TABLE 4: Religious Terms Are Kept as they Are in Both Translations

### (7 Examples)

| Original Wording              | Gabra's<br>Translation    | Enani's<br>Translation |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------|------------------------|
| BRABANTIO: O heaven!          | برابانتيو: ياللسماء!      |                        |
| How got she out? O            | كيف خرجت؟ بالخيانة        | خرجت؟ بل كيف خان       |
| treason of the blood! (I, i,  | الدم!                     | الدمُ؟                 |
| l. 170)                       | ,                         | ,                      |
| IAGO:I did full hard          | ياغو: ولكن، أرجوك         | أتراك عقدت قرانك       |
| forbear him. But, I pray      | سىيدى،                    | فعُلاً؟ أرجو ذلك حقاً! |
| you, sir,                     | هل تزوجت شرعاً؟           |                        |
| Are you fast married?         |                           |                        |
| (I, ii, II. 10-11)            |                           |                        |
| OTHELLO :She wish'd she       | عطیل: وتمنت لو انها       |                        |
| had not heard it, yet she     | لم تسمعها، ولكنها<br>تمنت | وقالت ليت أنى ما       |
| wish'd                        |                           | سمعتها، لكنه تمنت      |
| That heaven had made          | لو أِن السماء جعلتها      | لو أن رب الكون أبدع    |
| her such a man: she           | رجلاً مثل <i>ى</i> .      | خلقها رجلاً مثلى!      |
| thank'd me, (I, iii, II. 164- |                           |                        |
| 165)                          |                           |                        |
| OTHELLO For she is with       | عطيل: فإن تَعْمضْ         |                        |
| me: no, when light-wing'd     | خفاف الريش                | لن يُفلح خفقُ جناحَيْ  |
| toys                          | من ألاعيب كوبيد           | رب الحب بكل الريش      |
| Of feather'd Cupid seel       | المجنح عين بصيرتي         | المزدان به             |
| with wanton dullness          |                           | أن يخدع فكرى و         |
| My speculative and            |                           | حواسى                  |
| officed instruments, (I, iii, |                           |                        |
| II. 269-71)                   |                           |                        |
| Great Jove, Othello           | كاسيو: أيها العظيم        |                        |
| guard,(II,i, I. 77)           | جوبيتر، احرس عطيل،        |                        |
|                               |                           | عطيل!                  |
| and duck again as low         | عطيل: وليهبط بعدها        |                        |
| As hell's from heaven!        | هبوط الجحيم عن            | قاع الموجة             |
| (II, i, II. 188-189)          | السماء!                   |                        |
|                               |                           | فردوسٍ لحضيض           |
|                               |                           | سقر! ُ                 |
| Had it pleased heaven         | عطيل: لو أن مشيئة         | :لو أن البارى          |
| (IV, ii, I. 47)               | السماء                    |                        |

### D. Christian versus Muslim Awareness

The assumption that religious culture of the translator may interfere with his translation is supported by the three examples in Table 5, which all show that Gabra is well aware of the religious culture of the Shakespearean text. Therefore, he inserted three footnotes into his translation of these structures. He may have rendered this service to his readers to explain to them these specific Christian terms. This may be accepted if we consider the enlightenment as one of the major functions of translation as a human activity. Enani, on his side, inserted no footnotes to these three instances. On the contrary, he gave them Islamic equivalents to the point that his readers will never detect any Christian origin of these terms.

'All seals and symbols of redeemed sins' is translated as 'ورموز الخطيئة المفتداه'. A footnote is inserted to explain the 'redeemed sin': "Baptization in Christianity is the seal for the redemption of man from his sins. Therefore, it is the symbol of purification and coming back to innocence"<sup>2</sup>. Enani translated this structure as 'ويُطرح الذي لابد منه في محو الخطايا والذنوب'. This agrees with Enani's strategy of targeting the reception of his translation by his readers or 'readership' using Mona Baker's previously quoted term. Imitating Gabra could bring a lot of opposition to and hostility against Enani if he entered explanations similar to those of Gabra's.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Translation of this footnote and the other two are mine.

'Divinity of hell' is translated as 'انه لاهوت الجحيم' (Gabra). A second footnote is inserted, "Theology is the debate about good versus evil. lago is proud of being skillful in theological areas which he uses for the service of Devil. On the surface, he introduces something seemingly good, but it is used for evil purpose." Enani translated it as 'ديدن ابليس! اذا أراد الشيطان'.

'His board a shift' is rendered as ' الاعتراف (Gabra) and a third footnote is inserted to explain the meaning of 'board', "This is due to much teaching which she does as a teacher or as much as a priest may do to urge the sinner to do the confession and seek for redemption." Enani has avoided these minute details and translated 'board ...' as ' اوالتماس التوبة ...' والتماس التوبة ...

**TABLE 5: Christian versus Muslim Awareness (3 Examples)** 

| Original Wording  | Gabra's<br>Translation  | Enani's Translation                           |
|---|---|---|
| All seals and<br>symbols of<br>redeemed sin<br>(II, iii, II. 316) | ياغو: وبكل أختام ورموز الخطيئة المفتداة*. (*) المعمودية المسيحية هي الختم على افتداء الإنسان من الخطيئة، فهى بذلك رمز التطهر و العودة إلى البراءة.  | ويطرخ الذى لابد منه في<br>محو الخطايا والذنوب |
| Divinity of hell!<br>(II, iii, II. 322)                           | ياغو: انه لاهوت الجحيم (**) اللاهوت هنا هو الجدل الديني حول الخير والشر. ياغو يتباهى بأنه بارع في منطقة اللاهوتى الذي يجعله في خدمة الشيطان إذ يشير بما هو (في الظاهر)خير، ولكنه لغاية شريرة. | ديدن إبليس! إذا أراد شيطان                    |
| his board a<br>shrift<br>(I1I, iii, I. 24)                        | دیزدمونه: و مائدته<br>کرسی اعتراف**<br>**اکثرة ما تحثه کمعلمة أو<br>ککاهن یحث المعترف علی<br>الاستغفار.   | والمائدة كمثل خلوة اعتراف والتماس التوية!     |

### E. Identicalness

Table 6 includes ten examples of almost identical translations made by Gabra and Enani. 'bond-slaves and pagans' is translated as 'الأقنان وعبد الأوثان (Gabra), 'الأقنان وعبد الأوثان (Enani); 'The town will rise' المدينة (Enani); 'thou art a devil' (Gabra), النت شيطان مريد' (Gabra), النت شيطان الت شيطان مريد' (Gabra) المدينة (Enani); 'she was foul' 'كانت أشمة' (Gabra), 'كانت فاسقة' (Enani); 'Good faith' المقدسة' (Gabra) المقدسة' (Gabra) المقدسة' (Gabra) المقدسة' (Gabra) وطأها كاسيو' (Gabra) الماليو (Gabra) التاها كاسيو (Enani) and 'Cassio did top her' التاها كاسيو (Enani) التاها كاسيو (Enani) التاها كاسيو (Enani) التاها كاسيو

In two examples, we find that the two translators are affected by the other's religious culture. On the one hand, Gabra has translated 'her mask' into 'خمار ها' which is a typical Muslim piece of cloth used by Muslim women to cover their faces, heads and shoulders. Enani translated it as 'وشاح' that is neutral in its cultural meaning which Muslims as well as Christians can use. On the other hand, 'would have walked barefoot to Palestine for a touch of his lower lip' is translated as 'Gabra). Enani) اللسير حافية القدمين لقاء لمسة من شفته السفلي translated it as 'اسارت الى فلسطين حافية القدمين [تكفيراً عن الذنب]! A footnote is inserted between two square brackets denoting that walking or going to Palestine -in Christianity at that time- is done for redemption and seeking for forgiveness. But neither Gabra nor Enani mentioned it explicitly.

**TABLE 6: Identicalness in both Translations (10 Examples)** 

| Original Wording                   | Gabra's Translation                          | Enani's Translation             |
|------------------------------------|--|---------------------------------|
| Bond-slaves and                    | برابانتيو: فلن يصبح رجالات                   | ابات الأقنانِ وعِبَاد الأويَّان |
| pagans shall our                   | دولتنا الإ الأقنان وعبدة                     | ساسىة هذى الدولة!               |
| statesmen be.                      | الأوثان                                      |                                 |
| (I, ii, II. 100-101)               |  |                                 |
| The town will rise:                | ياجو: ستنهض المدينة                          | سوف يصحو النائمون في            |
| God's will,                        | بأسرها. من أجل الله، كفى!                    | المدينة. قدر الله وما شاء فعل!  |
| lieutenant, hold!                  |  |                                 |
| (II, iii, I. 143)                  | to first to                                  | ili. h kir oje e.               |
| To fetch her fan,                  | عطیل: لکی تحضری                              | حتى تأتى مثلاً بالمروحة أو      |
| her gloves, her mask, nor nothing? | مروحتها ، قفازها، خمارها،<br>أو أي شي؟       | القفاز؟ أو بوشاحٍ أو شيء آخر؟   |
| (IV,ii, I. 10)                     | اق اي <b>سني</b> .                           |                                 |
| (14,11, 1. 10)                     |  |                                 |
| I know a lady in                   | امیلیا: أعرف سیدة فی                         | :أعرف سيدة من البندقية تتمنى    |
| Venice would have                  | البندقية كانت مستعدة                         | أن تلمس شفته السفلي ولو         |
| walked barefoot                    | للسير حافية إلى فلسطين لقاء                  | سارت إلى فلسطين حافية           |
| to Palestine for a                 | لمسة من شفّته السفلي                         | القدمين[تكفيراً عن الذنب]!      |
| touch of his nether                |  | _                               |
| lip. (IV, iii, II. 38-39)          |  |                                 |
| Thou dost belie                    | إميليا: أنت تكذب بحقها                       | هذا افتراء كاذب عليها ـو انت    |
| her, and thou art a                | انت شیطان.                                   | شيطان مريد!!                    |
| devil. (V, ii, l. 134)             |  |                                 |
| O, she was foul! (V,               | عطيل: أه كانت فاسقة                          | بل كانت آثمة                    |
| ii, I. 202)                        |  |                                 |
| Good faith, a little               | مونتانو: بحياتك، واحدة                       | حلفتك أن تشرب كأساً أخرى لا     |
| one; not past a                    | صغيرة كأساً لا أكثر،                         | أكثر من ملء قدح!                |
| pint, as I am a                    | قسماً بجنديتي.                               | وبحق مكانتى الحربية             |
| soldier. (II, iii, I. 59)          | ( 30th 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 | I. ineti s.i. jiit eenti anie   |
| As proofs of holy writ:            | ياجو: كبراهين الكتب المقدسة.                 | كأنه التنزيلُ أو أَىُ الكتاب!   |
|                                    |  |                                 |
| (I1I, iii, I. 325)                 | عطيل: وطأها كاسيو                            | لقد اتاها (كاسيو)               |
| Cassio did top her;                | عطين وطاها حاسيو                             | بعد اناها (حاسيو)               |
| <br>(V, ii, I. 138 )               |  |                                 |
| and she is sport for               | ياجو: وهي لعبة تليق حتى                      | وهي تليق بمضجع رب الأرباب       |
| Jove.                              | بجوبيتر.                                     |                                 |
| (II, iii, I. 16)                   |  |                                 |

#### Conclusion

In this paper the attempt was made to study two translations into Arabic of William Shakespeare's *Othello* rendered by two great Arab translators from two different cultural backgrounds: Gabra Ibrahim Gabra and Professor Muhammad Enani. The paper investigated the religious culture and its impact on their translations.

On analyzing their two renderings, the strategies and methodologies of each translator could be revealed through excavating the corpus of study which was made of sixty-five parallel passages with the English original quotations. Intertextuality was detected in the translation passages used for criticism and analysis.

In addition, promotion of the language register –in Enani's translation-was manifest. This may be attributed to an immediate result of intertextuality with the Quranic verses which was detected in Gabra's translation as well.

It was found that while Enani had tried to domesticate his translation of *Othello* into the Arabic culture, Gabra foreignised his translation. The reading public seems to be targeted all the time by Enani. Gabra paid more attention to the original meanings of words in Shakespeare's text and their cultural context.

Culture and translation is a topic that needs to be studied in other works translated into Arabic. Translated works have to be adopted in the culture of the recipients in the target language. To do this, an endless search for the equivalents is demanded. We hope future studies will be able to maintain this objective.

### Works Cited

- -Abrams, M.H. *A Glossary of Literary Terms*. Fort Worth: Harcourt Brace College Publishers, 1993
- Alhilali, Muhammad and Muhsin, Muhammad Khan, translators. *Translation of the Meanings of the Noble Quran.* Madinah: King Fahad Complex for the Printing of the Holy Quran, 1997
- -Baker, Mona, ed. Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies. London: 2001
- -Gabra, Ibrahim Gabra. *Translation of the Great Shakespearean Tragedies*. Beirut: the Arab Organization for Studies and Publishing, 1986.
- جبرا، ابراهيم جبرا. وليم شكسبير: ترجمة المآسى الكبرى مع ترجمة دراسات نقدية. بيروت: المؤسسة العربية للدراسات والنشر، 1986
- -Enani, Muhammad. *Translation of Shakespeare's Othello*. Cairo: Egyptian, General Corporation for Book, 2005
- عنانى، د. محمد. ترجمة عطيل شعراً، مع تقديم وحواشى. القاهره: الهيئة المصرية العامة للكتاب، 2005
- -Yang, Wenfen. "Brief Study on Domestication and Foreignization in Translation", School of Foreign Languages, Qingdao University of Science and Technology, Qingdao, China
- < http://www.scribd.com/doc/76718193/Brief-Study-on-Domestication-and-Foreignization-in-Translation>
- <a href="http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/423527/oath">http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/423527/oath</a>
- <http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/secular> <http://web.uvic.ca/~mbest1/ISShakespeare/Oth/Othell o.TOC.html>

# الثقافة الدينية وتأثيرها على الترجمة الى العربية: ترجمة مسرحية عطيل لوليام شكسبير مثالاً

د. بشير العيسوى مدرس الأدب الانجليزى و النقد، قسم اللغات الأجنبية، كلية التربية، جامعة المنصوره

### ملخص

تسعى هذه الورقة الى دراسة ترجمتين مختلفتين فى فترتين متباعدتين لعمل واحد هو مسرحية عطيل لوليام شكسبير قام بهما اثنان من المترجمين العرب البارزين: الأول هو جبرا ابراهيم جبرا، أما الثانى فهو البروفيسور محمد عنانى. وتتساءل الدراسة عن مدى تأثير الثقافة الدينية لكل من المترجمين على ترجمتهما وتطرح السؤال الأساسى لها: الى أى مدى تدخلت تلك الثقافة تأثيراً على الترجمة؟ وقد تم اقتطاف خمسة وستين مقطعاً من الترجمتين مع أصولهما الانجليزية بغرض الدراسة والنقد. واستخدمت الدراسة ستة جداول لمعالجة الموضوعات التالية: لغة الحكف والقسر، المفردة العلمانية مقابل المفردة الدينية، التناص، حضور الوعى بالثقافة الدينية والتطابق فى الترجمتين.